

Contents lists available at [ScienceDirect](www.sciencedirect.com/science/journal/0025326X)

# Marine Pollution Bulletin

journal homepage: [www.elsevier.com/locate/marpolbul](https://www.elsevier.com/locate/marpolbul) 



# Assessment of trace metal concentrations in Indian Ocean silky sharks *Carcharhinus falciformis* and their toxicological concerns



Ming-Huang Wang  $\mathrm{a},\,$ Chiu-Wen Chen  $\mathrm{a},\,$  Chih-Feng Chen  $\mathrm{a},\,$  Wen-Pei Tsai  $\mathrm{^{b},\,Cheng\text{-}Di\,\,Dong\,a,\mathbf{^{\ast}}\,}$ 

<sup>a</sup> *Department of Marine Environmental Engineering, National Kaohsiung University of Science and Technology, Kaohsiung 81157, Taiwan* <sup>b</sup> *Department of Fisheries Production and Management, National Kaohsiung University of Science and Technology, Kaohsiung 81157, Taiwan* 



# **1. Introduction**

Silky shark *Carcharhinus falciformis* is one of the most common pelagic sharks in tropical waters, continental and island shelves, continental slopes, and offshore waters worldwide. In addition, silky sharks are the most common bycatch shark in tropical tuna longline and purse seine fisheries (Amandé et al., 2008). Globally, *C. falciformis* is endangered [\(Bonfil et al., 2009\)](#page-5-0), while it is considered vulnerable in the eastcentral and southeastern Pacific regions. They are a member of the requiem or gray sharks of the family Carcharhinidae which is one of the largest in the genus—reaching up to 330 cm in total length (Bonfil et al., [2009\)](#page-5-0). Adult *C. falciformis* are piscivorous [\(Compagno, 1984\)](#page-6-0), with juveniles feeding on pelagic fishes and crustaceans ([Filmalter et al., 2017](#page-6-0)), and form large feeding aggregations when food is plentiful [\(Bonfil,](#page-5-0)  [2008\)](#page-5-0). *C. falciformis* has become the focus of many biological monitoring studies due to its importance in fisheries, with the increasing trend of global shark catches. *C. falciformis* is by far the most caught species, representing up to 90% of the elasmobranch bycatch worldwide ([Gil](#page-6-0)[man, 2011](#page-6-0)). [Curnick et al. \(2020\)](#page-6-0) noted that over 56% of the species caught by longlines and purse seines were juveniles. With *C. falciformis*  exhibiting diel vertical migrations and oscillatory diving behavior, spending more than 99% of their time in the top 100 m, and diving to the depths of greater than 300 m, they directly overlap with the typical deployment areas of purse seine and longlines in the Indian Ocean ([Curnick et al., 2020\)](#page-6-0).

muscle in Taiwanese male and female adults suggests potential chronic non-carcinogenic health hazards.

Due to the bioaccumulation potential of heavy metals, they could be transferred through the food chain where large predatory fish like tuna, shark, and swordfish accumulate the highest concentrations [\(Burger and](#page-5-0)  [Gochfeld, 2011;](#page-5-0) [Domingo et al., 2006\)](#page-6-0). Notably, some metals biomagnify and lead to a critical accumulation in top predators such as sharks ([Storelli, 2008;](#page-6-0) [Adel et al., 2016](#page-5-0)). In recent years, marine pollution has become an issue of great concern [\(Anbuselvan et al., 2018](#page-5-0); [Sanjaigandhi et al., 2020](#page-6-0)). There is a range of persistent chemical contaminants such as heavy metals, ubiquitously distributed in marine environments and detected in a wide variety of marine organisms ([Chiuchiolo et al., 2004\)](#page-5-0). [Ghani et al. \(2012\)](#page-6-0) reported that arsenic and vanadium contamination in sediments of Mediterranean coast showed an average of 29.90  $\pm$  19.21 and 184.81  $\pm$  134.42 mg/kg, respectively, mainly attributed from offshore oil fields and industrial wastes. These pollutants released in the marine environment could be magnified through the food chain e.g., from water/sediments–plankton–small pelagics–higher predators [\(Chouvelon et al., 2019;](#page-5-0) [Albarico, et al., in](#page-5-0)  [press](#page-5-0)). Therefore, sharks being an apex ocean predator are highly susceptible to heavy metal bioaccumulation ([Adel et al., 2016](#page-5-0); [Kim et al.,](#page-6-0) 

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2022.113571>

0025-326X/© 2022 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved. Received 23 November 2021; Received in revised form 11 March 2022; Accepted 12 March 2022

<sup>\*</sup> Corresponding author. *E-mail address:* [cddong@nkust.edu.tw](mailto:cddong@nkust.edu.tw) (C.-D. Dong).

<span id="page-1-0"></span>





–: Data is not available; NA: Not detected; Min: minimum; Max: maximum; Ave: mean values; SD: standard deviations; MPI: including seven toxic elements (Cu, Zn, Pb, Cd, Cr, Ni and As).

### [2019\)](#page-6-0).

There have been a few studies on the trace metal concentrations and bioaccumulation in *C. falciformis*. Three of the literatures focused on mercury concentrations from *C. falciformis* caught along Mexico [\(Ter](#page-6-0)razas-López [et al., 2016;](#page-6-0) [O'Bryhim et al., 2017](#page-6-0); [Rodríguez-Guti](#page-6-0)érrez [et al., 2020\)](#page-6-0). Similarly, a recent study in Mexican waters reported the bioaccumulation and biomagnification of various metals (Hg, Pb, Cd, Cu, As, Se, Zn, Cr, V, Fe, Ni, Co, and Mn) from shark muscle tissues ( $\acute{A}$ lvaro-Berlanga et al., 2021). However, there were no studies in the Indian Ocean region which motivated this research to be undertaken. This study aimed to (1) describe the concentrations of heavy metals from *C. falciformis* muscle tissue, (2) determine the correlations of heavy metals, and (3) assess heavy metal bioaccumulation relative to that of seawater (background). The results of this study provide a baseline on the heavy metal concentrations in the muscle tissue of *C. falciformis*  caught from Indian Ocean region.

#### **2. Materials and methods**

# *2.1. Study area and sample collection*

Muscle tissues from the caudal peduncle (Fig. S1) were collected from juvenile *C. falciformis*; caught from the Indian Ocean using longlines between 2015 and 2018 (*n* = 20). Basic information on *C. falciformis* include sex, total length, and body weight (Table 1). Biological data from S5 was missing; therefore, although metal concentrations were measured, data from this individual was not used in the correlation analysis between biological parameters and metal contents. The total length (TL) ranged between 70 and 190 cm. The weight ranged between 2.5 and 36 kg. The condition factor (K) was also measured in this study.

# *2.2. Sample preparation and determination of elements*

Total concentrations of nine heavy metals (Cu, Zn, Pb, Cd, Cr, Ni, As, Co and V) were analyzed using inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry (ICP-MS; Thermo Fisher Scientific iCAP RQ ICP-MS, USA). Approximately 0.050 g of homogenized dried shark muscle was digested by adding 10 mL HNO<sub>3</sub> and heating at 95  $\degree$ C for 4 h. Digested samples were cooled at room temperature and diluted with double distilled water; and the dilution factors were calculated based on the dry sample weight. The ICP-MS analysis was carried out in KED mode. This method provided better accuracy and precision, and the trace elements showed definite differences. Blank was carried out for instrument calibration. The accuracy and precision of the results were checked using standard reference materials (DORM-4) supplied from the National Research Council of Canada (CNRC). The certified reference material DORM-4 (Dogfish muscle reference material, NRC Canada) was used to guarantee method accuracy. The observed values are presented in Table S1. All metal results were expressed in wet weight concentrations.

#### *2.3. Data analyses*

Statistical analysis was conducted using Microsoft Excel 2019 and SPSS Statistics (SPSS software 20.0). Data were summarized as min, max, and mean, along with standard deviations. Allometric growth model was conducted to describe the length-weight relationship of *C. falciformis* with the formula:  $W = aL^b$ , where W is the body weight, L is the total length, a is the intercept constant, and b is the length-weight relationship index [\(Le Cren, 1951\)](#page-6-0). Condition factor was calculated using the formula:  $K = W/L^b$  to evaluate the biological and physiological condition [\(Devaraj, 1973](#page-6-0); [Acharya and Dwivedi, 1985](#page-5-0); [Sharma et al.,](#page-6-0)  [2005\)](#page-6-0). The metal pollution index (MPI) which is a toxic element content index was used to compare the metal loads in *C. falciformis* muscles. MPI was calculated using the following formula ([Usero et al., 1997\)](#page-6-0):  $MPI =$  $\left(cf_1 \times cf_2 \times cf_3 \times \ldots \times cf_n\right)^{1/n}$  , where  $cf_n$  is the concentration of metal  $n$ in the examined tissue (mg/g dry weight). The bioconcentration factor (BCF) is defined as the net result of the absorption, distribution, and elimination of a substance in any organism after exposure via water. The BCF was also used to evaluate the element accumulation capability of *C. falciformis* exposed to contaminated water. BCF was calculated using the equation:  $BCF = C_s/C_w$ , where  $C_s$  and  $C_w$  denote the concentrations of elements in the muscular tissues of *C. falciformis* (mg/kg wet weight) and seawater (mg/L), respectively ([Ju et al., 2021\)](#page-6-0). Because the concentration of elements in seawater usually remains within a narrow

<span id="page-2-0"></span>

**Fig. 1.** Relationship between total length (L) and body weight (W) of *Carcharhinus falciformis*.

range, the difference in the element concentration between inshore seawater and ocean seawater is usually less than one order of magnitude ([Lau et al., 1998](#page-6-0)). Thus, the seawater metal concentrations were based on the information given by [Neff \(2002\).](#page-6-0) The concentrations used for each element were: Cu (0.35), Zn (0.12), Pb (0.1), Cd (0.1), Cr (0.55), Ni (1.0), As (3.0), Co (0.19), and V (1.9) mg/L. Spearman's rank correlation coefficient (r) was used to evaluate the correlations between various parameters. Shark characteristics were presented using descriptive statistics. Principal components analysis (PCA) were performed for trace metals using Varimax Method with a component rotation having an eigenvalue *>* 1.

### *2.4. Human health risk assessments*

The potential human health risk of consuming *C. falciformis* muscles was measured in terms of the HQ and THI. The *HQ* is a proportion of estimated daily intake (EDI, μg/kg/day) to chronic oral reference dose ( $RfD$ ,  $\mu$ g/kg/day); HQ = EDI/RfD. The EDI was estimated according to the element concentration (CE, μg/g wet weight), the daily consumption (DCfish, g/day) of *C. falciformis* muscles, and the mean body weight (BW, kg) of Taiwanese adults; EDI = (CE × *DCfish*) / BW was determined according to the data of the Integrated Risk Information System [\(https](https://www.epa.gov/iris)  [://www.epa.gov/iris\)](https://www.epa.gov/iris) developed by the USEPA in 2020 ([USEPA,](#page-6-0)  [2020\)](#page-6-0), except the doses of Pb and Co, which were determined according to the studies reported by [Orisakwe et al. \(2017\)](#page-6-0) and [Finley et al. \(2012\)](#page-6-0). In this study, the dataset followed our previous report  $(Ju \text{ et al.}, 2021)$ .

**Table 2** 

Comparison for metal concentrations (mg/kg ww) among different shark worldwide.							
---	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

The THI is a summation of HQ of all metal elements. When the HQ or THI is less than 1.0, consuming *C. falciformis* muscles will not pose a significant non-carcinogenic risk. Possible health risks increase as HQ or THI increases. When the THI is greater than 10, the non-carcinogenic risk is considered extremely high ([Ju et al., 2021\)](#page-6-0).

# **3. Results and discussion**

# *3.1. Biometric characteristics of C. falciformis*

Biometric characteristics such as length and weight are important parameters in shark research. [Joung et al. \(2008\)](#page-6-0) estimated that 50% of silky sharks from northern Taiwan waters mature at 212.5 cm total length, using the logistic curve describing the relationship between total length and the proportion of maturity in each length interval. The latter results suggest that *C. falciformis* selected for trace metal analysis in this study were juveniles. To clarify the effect of metal bioaccumulation on the physiological condition of *C. falciformis*, the condition factor (*K*) was used. The condition factor can be estimated using weight (W) and length (L) of the *C. falciformis* following [Sharma et al. \(2005\)](#page-6-0), where W is the shark bodyweight in grams, L is the total length in cm, and b is the exponent of the length-weight relationship, which can be obtained from the allometric growth model described by [Kumar et al. \(2018\)](#page-6-0) where a is the constant of intercept. Fig. 1 shows the relationship between total length (L) and body weight (W) for *C. falciformis*. The *R*2 shows a higher value of 0.9545. The model  $W = aTL^b$  defined, resulted to  $4.26 \times 10^{-6}$ , and b value of 3.132. The condition factors (K) are presented in [Table 1](#page-1-0). The level of the physiological condition K ranged between 6.4 and 11.0.

### *3.2. Trace element concentrations in C. falciformis*

The trace metals, Cu, Zn, Pb, Cd, Cr, Ni, As, Co and V were determined using ICP-MS. The values for trace metals measured in the muscle are illustrated in [Table 1.](#page-1-0) The Cu concentration ranged between 0.36 and 0.96 mg/kg, with an average concentration of  $0.65 \pm 0.17$  mg/kg. These concentrations were far lower compared to *C. falciformis* in Mexico having  $26.8 \pm 27.9$  mg/kg [\(Alvaro-Berlanga](#page-5-0) et al., 2021), and other species like *C. obscurus* and *Isurus oxyrinchus* (Table 2). The regulatory maximum limits indicated for the copper ion is 5 mg/day ([SCF,](#page-6-0)  [2006\)](#page-6-0) suggesting that the metal concentrations were within the allowable levels. In this study, the Zn concentrations ranged from 5.2 to 63.6 mg/kg. These results were correspondingly lower compared to Zn concentrations  $(168.3 \pm 101.53 \text{ mg/kg}, n = 30)$  in *C. falciformis* caught from Mexico ([Alvaro-Berlanga](#page-5-0) et al., 2021), but are higher than other shark species worldwide (Table 2). Similarly, Pb concentrations (0.12–1.11 mg/kg) were lower than *C. falciformis* in Mexico, but higher than other species. However, other shark species like *G. galeus* in Azores, Portugal ([Torres et al., 2016](#page-6-0)), and *C. obscurus* and *C. umbratile* in Korea [\(Kim](#page-6-0) 



–: Data is not available.



**Fig. 2.** Box plots showing the distributions of bioaccumulation factors of metals in *C. falciformis* muscular tissues.

[et al., 2019](#page-6-0)) showed slightly comparable concentrations ([Table 2\)](#page-2-0). These concentrations were over the limits recommended by the UN committee for Pb concentrations (0.3 mg/kg), hence immediate attention is necessary. The Cd concentration  $(0.84 \pm 0.21 \text{ mg/kg})$  showed similarly lower concentrations than its conspecifics in Mexico  $(A)$ <sub>Varo-Berlanga</sub> [et al., 2021](#page-5-0)). However, Reátegui-Quispe and Pariona-Velarde (2019) observed that concentrations of Cd in blue shark *Prionace glauca* were 0.01–0.04 mg/kg which is lower than this study. The Cr concentration ranged between 0.57 and 7.53 mg/kg which is higher than the rest of the world [\(Table 2\)](#page-2-0). Ni showed comparable concentrations with Pb and Cd in this study (0.38  $\pm$  0.51 mg/kg). As displayed concentrations from 1.36 to 4.23 mg/kg with an average of  $2.55 \pm 0.83$  mg/kg. In the same species, *C. falciformis*, *Álvaro-Berlanga et al.* (2021) showed a significantly higher concentration of  $152.2 \pm 87.7$  mg/kg for As. Similarly, As concentrations in this study showed lower values than the rest of the shark species worldwide ([Table 2\)](#page-2-0). As compounds are mostly soluble in water, hence, As is more likely to be present in seafood. According to Food Safety Focus (2007), the level of As can range from 1 to 10 mg/kg in fish and up to 100 mg/kg in bottom feeders and shellfish. Co and V exhibited the lowest concentrations among the nine trace metals (Co:  $0.0071 \pm 0.0074$ ; V:  $0.02 \pm 0.009$  mg/kg). Generally, the differences on metal concentrations in sharks observed worldwide could be attributed to the ontogeny, trophic levels, and different foraging areas [\(Bonfil,](#page-5-0)  [2008;](#page-5-0) [Newman et al., 2012](#page-6-0)). The confidence intervals of simple linear regression for different metal concentrations in the muscular tissues of *C. falciformis* are found in Fig. S2. The data point of Cu and As were all in the confidence intervals (95%) of nine elements. The highest

**Table 3** 



concentration of Cr, Co, Pb, Ni, and V was out of 95% of confidence intervals. On the other hand, the lowest concentration of Cd, Cr, Co, Pb, and Ni were out of 95% of the confidence intervals range. The Zn, Cr, Co, and Pb were showing in the same pattern.

# *3.3. Elemental bioaccumulation in sharks (MPI and BCF)*

Sharks are used as human food (meat and soup in Asia, Europe, USA, Africa, and Australia), in the industries (skin, shark liver oil), and for medicinal purposes (vitamin A) ([Kibria and Haroon, 2015\)](#page-6-0). Thus, the presence of metal pollution in sharks could compromise human health and product quality. Metal pollution index (MPI) was used to compare the metal loads of Cu, Zn, Pb, Cd, and As in *C. falciformis* [\(Usero et al.,](#page-6-0)  [1997\)](#page-6-0). MPI ranged between 0.70 and 2.05, with an average of 1.15  $\pm$ 0.33. MPI was greatly contributed by Cr and Ni, which were defined as the MPI indicator in shark muscle. For the issue of food safety, the BCF was used to understand the metal accumulation in *C. falciformis*. When aquatic organisms absorb a substance at a rate higher than they can metabolize and eliminate, bioaccumulation occurs. Hence, toxic substances with longer biological half-life (e.g., trace metals) can pose a high chronic health risk due to bioaccumulation even if their concentrations in the water is extremely low  $(Ju et al., 2021)$ . Estimates of BCF were shown in Fig. 2. The seawater metal information was cited from [Neff \(2002\).](#page-6-0) Several studies discussed the environmental pollutant heavy metals in the Indian Ocean [\(van der Schyff et al., 2020;](#page-6-0) [Tamele](#page-6-0)  [and Loureiro, 2020](#page-6-0); [Moffett and German, 2020](#page-6-0)). In this study, Zn and Cu have the highest contribution for trace metal accumulation in sharks. The log BCF value of elements was higher than 1 indicating the metal's bioaccumulative behavior ([USEPA, 1991](#page-6-0)). Co and V were the lowest accumulation factor in the shark of the muscular tissues. Alarmingly, bioaccumulation factors for Zn *>* Cu *>* Cd *>* Cr *>* Pb *>* As *>* Ni were greater than 2 (BCF *>* Log 2.0) indicating significantly high metal accumulation.

# *3.4. Spearman and PCA analysis with relations between characteristics and trace elements in muscle tissue*

The relationship between body length and weight and metal contents were evaluated. Several studies have reported metal concentrations associated with body size in sharks ([Kim et al., 2019;](#page-6-0) [Turoczy et al.,](#page-6-0)  [2000\)](#page-6-0). Table 3 describes the correlation between the total length, weight, metal concentrations, and MPI. Levels of Cd in muscle decreased significantly  $(p < 0.05)$  with shark length; in the case of shark weight, the Co concentration increased significantly  $(p < 0.05)$ . The condition factor (*K*) had no significant correlation with other metal elements. The concentration of Cd (*r* = 0.263, *p >* 0.05) and V (*r* = 0.064, *p >* 0.05) had no significant correlation with the MPI (*p >* 0.05), whereas the concentration of the other seven metal elements showed a significantly positive correlation with the MPI ( $r = 0.490-0.615$ ,  $p < 0.05$ ). Highly



\* Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed). \*\* Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

#### **Table 4**

Principal components estimated on the variable item of *C. falciformis*.



Rotation method: Varimax with Kaiser normalization.

Bold = loadings *>* 0.65.

significant correlations between Cu and Pb were determined (*r* = 0.675, *p <* 0.01). MPI and Cu had the highest correlation compared to other metals, hence, Cu can be an indicator element for MPI. Spearman's rank correlation showed there was no correlation between TL and Cd concentrations (*p <* 0.05) with Blue sharks (*Prionace glauca*) ([Castro-Rendon](#page-5-0)  [et al., 2021\)](#page-5-0).

The results of PCA (varimax rotation) obtained a total of four principal components (PC1 to PC4), which can explain 81.0% of the biometric characteristics and the trace metal concentration variability (Table 4). PC1 can explain 31.6% of all variation, among which Cr, Ni, Co, and V have relatively high factor loadings (larger than 0.70) and Cr, Ni, and Co are positive. [Demirezen and Uruc \(2006\)](#page-6-0) described that Ni and Cr are biological essential elements because they play an important role in a variety of enzymes and other cellular components. [Kowalska](#page-6-0)  [et al. \(2020\)](#page-6-0) noted that cobalt is a component of vitamin B12 (cobalamin), a coenzyme that is essential in the formation of proteins, nucleic acids, and red blood corpuscles. Moreover, the authors mentioned that the largest amounts of cobalt are found in muscles, approx. 43%. The PC2 explained 25.5% of the variation, in which TL (cm), weight (kg), and condition factor (K) showed relatively high loadings, implying that PC2 represents the level of biometric characteristics content in *C. falciformis*. The PC3 explained 14.7% of the variation, in which Cu, Zn, and Pb showed a relatively high positive load, PC3 represents the toxic elements in *C. falciformis* muscle tissue. The PC4 describes 9.2% of the variation. The metal As have relatively high loading. Therefore, the PC4 represents the concentration of As, which for marine animals increases with higher trophic levels, but may also be affected by dietary intake and the ability to absorb, metabolize, and accumulate As in their bodies [\(Ju et al., 2021](#page-6-0)). Fig. 3 shows the scatter diagram of PC1 and PC2 to PC4 scores for all 20 shark samples. Metals like Cr, Ni, Co, and V have relatively high factor loadings observed in this study. In Fig. 3A, shark 12, shark 14 were observed to have higher Cr and V concentrations. According to the distribution of PC1 and PC3 scores (Fig. 3B), Cu, Zn, and Pb showed relatively high positive load, while the S4, S12, and S14 can be observed with the higher concentrations of these three elements. The PC4 score of the S7, S12, and S14 have relatively higher As concentrations than that of other sharks (Fig. 3C).

#### *3.5. Estimation of human health risks by consumption*

Shark meat consumption is a global trend [\(Dent and Clarke, 2015](#page-6-0)), especially in some countries in Asia, which could be related to cultural or traditional reasons rather than for real health benefits [\(Dell'Apa et al.,](#page-6-0)  [2014\)](#page-6-0). [Table 5](#page-5-0) presents the HQ and THI values estimated based on the mean concentrations of various elements in the muscular tissues of silky



**Fig. 3.** The principal components analysis of metals in *C. falciformis.* 

sharks and the mean consumption of saltwater fishes by Taiwanese male and female adults. The content of inorganic As in fish usually accounts for 0.5% to 10% of total As; therefore, in this study, the HQ of As was estimated by converting 6% of the total As into inorganic As values ([Rahman et al., 2012;](#page-6-0) [Copat et al., 2013;](#page-6-0) [Boldrocchi et al., 2019\)](#page-5-0). The HQ of all estimated elements was higher than 1, with As found to be the main contributor (85% of total HQ in Best Case; 56% of total HQ in Worst Case) in this study. Moreover, THI was greater than 1 in both male and female adults; and the health risk faced by male adults (Best Case: THI = 4.22; Worst Case: THI = 20) were slightly lower than that of females (Best Case: THI =  $8.01$ ; Worst Case: THI = 38). The THI ratio of Worst/ Best Case scenarios were almost at 5. This implies that long-term consumption of sharks by adults may cause chronic non-carcinogenic health hazards. The accumulation of As in fish muscles and their high toxicity to humans are often considered noteworthy elements in health

#### <span id="page-5-0"></span>**Table 5**

Risk assessment of consuming shark for Taiwanese male and female adults.



<sup>a</sup> RfD adopted from [USEPA \(2020\)](#page-6-0), and Pb and Co from [Orisakwe et al. \(2017\)](#page-6-0) and [Finley et al. \(2012\)](#page-6-0).<br><sup>b</sup> The value represents the As inorganic form that were calculated taking into account 6% of total As (Boldrocchi et

risk assessment ([Ju et al., 2021](#page-6-0)). But usually, the risk is lesser than other metals because of the dominance of inert organic forms of As. However, V ( $HQ = 0.2738$  and 0.5193) is also a remarkable element in this study, even though it is an essential element for humans and is quickly excreted through urine and bile after absorption in the human body (Bhattacharya et al., 2016). In other studies, the V values were observed mainly in the central area of the Adriatic Sea for anchovy (V 89.9 μg/kg ww), red mullet (V 79.1 μg/kg ww), and mackerel (V 43.5 μg/kg ww), which is estimated to contribute 11–34% of the daily vanadium ingestion with fish, calculated for the population of the Adriatic coast ([Sepe et al.,](#page-6-0)  [2003\)](#page-6-0). Based on these results of best or the worse case, silky sharks caught from the study sites could pose potential chronic noncarcinogenic health hazards to male and female Taiwanese adults (The worst case of THI is greater than 10, the non-carcinogenic risk is extremely high).

#### **4. Conclusions**

This study assessed the concentrations of nine trace metals in *C. falciformis* caught from the Indian Ocean. The juvenile *C. falciformis* in this study were selected for trace metal analysis. To clarify the effect of metal bioaccumulation on the physiological condition of *C. falciformis*, the condition factor (K) was used. The trace elements concentrations among shark species can be affected by ontogeny, trophic levels, and foraging areas, explaining the differences in the trace metal levels in shark specimens. The MPI was much higher in Cr and Ni than other metals (Cu, Zn, Pb, Cd, and As) which were defined as an MPI indicator in shark muscle. The BCF value of elements was higher than 1. The Co and V were the lowest accumulation factor in the shark of the muscular tissues. MPI and Cu were highly correlated compared to other metals, making Cu a potential indicator element for MPI. The PCA can explain 81.0% of the biometric characteristics and the trace metal concentration variability. For the human health risks by consumption, the Taiwanese male and female adults who regularly eat shark muscles are exposed to potential chronic non-carcinogenic health hazards.

#### **CRediT authorship contribution statement**

**Ming-Huang Wang:** Conceptualization, Methodology, Data curation, Writing – original draft, Formal analysis, Visualization. **Chiu-Wen Chen:** Resources, Supervision, Project administration. **Chih-Feng Chen:**  Data curation, Formal analysis, Visualization, Writing – review  $\&$  editing. **Wen-Pei Tsai:** Investigation, Validation, Methodology. **Cheng-Di Dong:** Writing – review & editing, Resources, Supervision, Funding acquisition.

#### **Declaration of competing interest**

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

# **Appendix A. Supplementary data**

Supplementary data to this article can be found online at [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2022.113571)  [org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2022.113571.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2022.113571)

#### **References**

[Acharya, P., Dwivedi, S.N., 1985. Some aspects of the biology of Trypauchen vagina](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162300396373)  (Bloch & [Schneider\) of Bombay coast. J. Indian Fish. Assoc. 14](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162300396373)&15, 1–15.

- Adel, M., Conti, G.O., Dadar, M., Mahjoub, M., Copat, C., Ferrante, M., 2016. Heavy metal concentrations in edible muscle of white cheek shark, Carcharhinus dussumieri (Elasmobranchii, Chondrichthyes) from the Persian Gulf: a food safety issue. Food Chem. Toxicol. 97, 135–140. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fct.2016.09.002.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fct.2016.09.002)
- Albarico et al., in pressAlbarico, F.P.J.B., Lim, Y.C., Wang, M.H., Ju, Y.R., Chen, C.W., & Dong, C.D., (in press). Comparative trace metal assessment in phytoplankton using size and density fractionation. Mar. Pollut. Bull.
- Álvaro-Berlanga, S., Calatayud-Pavía, C.E., Cruz-Ramírez, A., Soto-Jiménez, M.F., Liñán-Cabello, M.A., 2021. Trace elements in muscle tissue of three commercial shark species: Prionace glauca, Carcharhinus falciformis, and Alopias pelagicus off the Manzanillo, Colima coast, Mexico. Environ. Sci. Pollut. R. 28, 22679–22692. [https://](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-020-12234-5)  [doi.org/10.1007/s11356-020-12234-5](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-020-12234-5).
- Amand´[e, M.J., Chassot, E., Chavance, P., Pianet, R., 2008. Silky Shark Bycatch in the](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162247235101) [French Purse Seine Fishery of the Indian Ocean. IOTC-WPEB-2008-16](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162247235101).
- Anbuselvan, N., Nathan, D.S., Sridharan, M., 2018. Heavy metal assessment in surface sediments off Coromandel Coast of India: implication on marine pollution. Mar. Pollut. Bull. 131, 712–726. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2018.04.074.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2018.04.074)
- Bhattacharya, P.T., Misra, S.R., Hussain, M., 2016. Nutritional aspects of essential trace elements in oral health and disease: an extensive review. Scientifica (Cairo) 2016, 5464373. [https://doi.org/10.1155/2016/5464373.](https://doi.org/10.1155/2016/5464373)
- Boldrocchi, G., Monticelli, D., Moussa Omar, Y., Bettinetti, R., 2019. Trace elements and POPs in two commercial shark species from Djibouti: implications for human exposure. Sci. Total Environ. 669, 637–648. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.03.122) [scitotenv.2019.03.122.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.03.122)
- [Bonfil, R., 2008. The biology and ecology of the Silky Shark, Carcharhinus falciformis. In:](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162301225951)  [Camhi, M., Pikitch, E.K., Babcock, E.A. \(Eds.\), Sharks of the Open Ocean: Biology,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162301225951)  [Fisheries and Conservation. Blackwell Science, pp. 114](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162301225951)–127.
- [Bonfil, R., Amorim, A., Anderson, C., Arauz, R., Baum, J., Clarke, S.C., Graham, R.T.,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162301418960) Gonzalez, M., Jolón, M., Kyne, P.M., Mancini, P., Márquez, F., Ruíz, C., Smith, W., [2009. Carcharhinus falciformis. The IUCN Red List of Threatened Species 2009: e.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162301418960) [T39370A10183906](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162301418960).
- Burger, J., Gochfeld, M., 2011. Mercury and selenium levels in 19 species of saltwater fish from New Jersey as a function of species, size, and season. Sci. Total. Environ. 409, 1418–1429. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2010.12.034.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2010.12.034)
- Castro-Rendon, R.D., Calle-Moran, M.D., Garcia-Arevalo, I., Ordiano-Flores, A., Galvan-Magana, F., 2021. Mercury and cadmium concentrations in muscle tissue of the blue shark (Prionace glauca) in the Central Eastern Pacific Ocean. Biol. Trace Elem. Res. Early Access. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12011-021-02932-7>.
- Chiuchiolo, A.L., Dickhut, R.M., Cochran, M.A., Ducklow, H.W., 2004. Persistent organic pollutants at the base of the Antarctic marine food web. Environ. Sci. Technol. 38, 3551–3557. [https://doi.org/10.1021/es0351793.](https://doi.org/10.1021/es0351793)
- Chouvelon, T., Strady, E., Harmelin-Vivien, M., Radakovitch, O., Brach-Papa, C., Crochet, S., Knoery, J., Rozuel, E., Thomas, B., Tronczynski, J., Chiffoleau, J.F., 2019. Patterns of trace metal bioaccumulation and trophic transfer in a

#### <span id="page-6-0"></span>*M.-H. Wang et al.*

phytoplankton-zooplankton-small pelagic fish marine food web. Mar. Pollut. Bull. 146, 1013–1030. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2019.07.047>.

gno, L.J., 1984. Sharks of the world. FAO Species Cat. Fish. Purp. 4, 251–255. Copat, C., Arena, G., Fiore, M., Ledda, C., Fallico, R., Sciacca, S., Ferrante, M., 2013.

- Heavy metals concentrations in fish and shellfish from eastern Mediterranean Sea: consumption advisories. Food Chem. Toxicol. 53, 33–37. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fct.2012.11.038)  [fct.2012.11.038](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fct.2012.11.038).
- Curnick, D.J., Andrzejaczek, S., Jacoby, D.M.P., Coffey, D.M., Carlisle, A.B., Chapple, T. K., Ferretti, F., Schallert, R.J., White, T., Block, B.A., Koldewey, H.J., Collen, B., 2020. Behavior and ecology of silky sharks around the chagos archipelago and evidence of Indian Ocean wide movement. Front. Mar. Sci. 7, 596619. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.3389/fmars.2020.596619)  [org/10.3389/fmars.2020.596619.](https://doi.org/10.3389/fmars.2020.596619)
- Dell'[Apa, A., Chad Smith, M., Kaneshiro-Pineiro, M.Y., 2014. The influence of culture on](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162246247623)  [the international management of shark finning. Environ. Management 54, 151](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162246247623)–161.
- Demirezen, D., Uruc, K., 2006. Comparative study of trace elements in certain fish, meat and meat products. Meat Sci. 74, 255–260. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ejar.2012.08.003) [ejar.2012.08.003.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ejar.2012.08.003)
- [Dent, F., Clarke, S., 2015. State of the global market for shark products. In: FAO Fisheries](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162327427561)  [and Aquaculture Technical Paper. FAO, Rome. No. 590](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162327427561).
- [Devaraj, M., 1973. Biology-of the large](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162246482226)⋅snakehead Ophiocephalus marulius in [Bhavanisagav waters. J. Indian Fish. Assoc. 20, 280](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162246482226)–307.
- Domingo, J.L., Bocio, A., Falcó, G., Llobet, J.M., 2006. Benefits and risks of fish consumption part I. A quantitative analysis of the intake of omega-3 fatty acids and chemical contaminants. Toxicology 230, 219–226. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tox.2006.11.054)  [tox.2006.11.054](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tox.2006.11.054).
- Filmalter, J.D., Cowley, P.D., Potier, M., Menard, F., Smale, M.J., Cherel, Y., Dagorn, L., 2017. Feeding ecology of silky sharks Carcharhinus falciformis associated with floating objects in the western Indian Ocean. J. Fish Biol. 90, 1321–1337. [https://](https://doi.org/10.1111/jfb.13241)  [doi.org/10.1111/jfb.13241](https://doi.org/10.1111/jfb.13241).
- Finley, B.L., Monnot, A.D., Paustenbach, D.J., Gaffney, S.H., 2012. Derivation of a chronic oral reference dose for cobalt. Regul. Toxicol. Pharmacol. 64, 491–503. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yrtph.2012.08.022.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yrtph.2012.08.022)
- Ghani, S.A.A., Shobier, A.H., Shreadah, M.A., 2012. Assessment of arsenic and vanadium pollution in surface sediments of the Egyptian Mediterranean coast. Int. J. Environ. Technol. Manag. 16, 82–101. [https://doi.org/10.1504/IJETM.2013.050673.](https://doi.org/10.1504/IJETM.2013.050673)
- Gilman, E.L., 2011. Bycatch governance and best practice mitigation technology in global tuna fisheries. Mar. Pol. 35, 590–609. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpol.2011.01.021)  [marpol.2011.01.021](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpol.2011.01.021).
- Hussey, N.E., Hedges, K.J., Barkley, A.N., Treble, M.A., Peklova, I., Ferguson, S.H., Yurkowski, D.J., Kessel, S.T., Bedard, J.M., Fisk, A.T., Webber, D.M., 2017. Movements of a deep-water fish: establishing marine fisheries management boundaries in coastal Arctic waters. Ecol. Appl. 27, 687–704. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1002/eap.1485)  [10.1002/eap.1485](https://doi.org/10.1002/eap.1485).
- Joung, S., Chen, C., Lee, H., Liu, K., 2008. Age, growth, and reproduction of silky sharks, Carcharhinus falciformis, in northeastern Taiwan waters. Fish. Res. 90, 78–85. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fishres.2007.09.025>.
- Ju, Y.R., Chen, C.F., Chen, C.W., Wang, M.H., Joung, S.J., Yu, C.J., Liu, W.M., Tsai, W.P., Liu, S.Y.A.O., Dong, C.D., 2021. Profile and consumption risk assessment of trace elements in megamouth sharks (Megachasma pelagios) captured from the Pacific Ocean to the east of Taiwan. Environ. Pollut. 269, 116161. [https://doi.org/10.1016/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2020.116161)  [j.envpol.2020.116161.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2020.116161)
- [Kibria, G., Haroon, A.K.Y., 2015. Pollutants' Bioaccumulation in Sharks and Shark](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162256398765)  [Seafood Security, 13 p.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162256398765)
- Kim, S.W., Han, S.J., Kim, Y., Jun, J.W., Giri, S.S., Chi, C., Yun, S., Kim, H.J., Kim, S.G., Kang, J.W., Kwon, J., Oh, W.T., Cha, J., Han, S., Lee, B.C., Park, T., Kim, B.Y., Park, S.C., 2019. Heavy metal accumulation in and food safety of shark meat from Jeju island, Republic of Korea. PLoS One 14, e0212410. [https://doi.org/10.1371/](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0212410)  [journal.pone.0212410](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0212410).
- Kowalska, G.O.D., Pankiewicz, U., Kowalski, R., 2020. Determination of the level of selected elements in canned meat and fish and risk assessment for consumer health. J. Anal. Methods Chem. 2020, 2148794. [https://doi.org/10.1155/2020/2148794.](https://doi.org/10.1155/2020/2148794)
- [Kumar, S.A., Thushari, G.G.N., Jayasena, D.D., 2018. Comparative analysis of](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162257062776) [morphological characteristics of clam \(Marcia opima\) in Mannar coastal belt, Sri](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162257062776) [Lanka. Int. J. Fish. Aquat. Stud. 6, 392](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162257062776)–399.
- Lau, S., Mohamed, M., Yen, A.T.C., Su'ut, S., 1998. Accumulation of heavy metals in freshwater molluscs. Sci. Total Environ. 214, 113–121. [https://doi.org/10.1016/](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0048-9697(98)00058-8)  [S0048-9697\(98\)00058-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0048-9697(98)00058-8).
- Le Cren, C.D., 1951. The length-weight relationship and seasonal cycle in gonad weights and condition in perch, Percajluviatilis. J. Anim. Ecol. 20, 201–209. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.2307/1540)  [10.2307/1540](https://doi.org/10.2307/1540).
- *Marine Pollution Bulletin 178 (2022) 113571*
- Moffett, J.W., German, C.R., 2020. Distribution of iron in the Western Indian Ocean and the Eastern tropical South pacific: an inter-basin comparison. Chem. Geol. 532, 119334. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemgeo.2019.119334>.
- [Neff, J.M., 2002. Bioaccumulation in marine organisms. In: Effects of Contaminants From](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162257540721)  [Oil Well Produced Water. Elsevier Science Publishers, Amsterdam](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162257540721).
- Newman, S.P., Handy, R.D.Gruber, 2012. Ontogenetic diet shifts and prey selection in nursery bound lemon sharks, *Negaprion brevirostris*, indicate a flexible foraging tactic. Environ. Biol. Fishes 95, 115-126. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10641-011-98.
- O'Bryhim, J.R., Adams, D.H., Spaet, J.L.Y., Mills, G., Lance, S.L., 2017. Relationships of mercury concentrations across tissue types, muscle regions and fins for two shark species. Environ. Pollut. 223, 323–333. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2017.01.029)  [envpol.2017.01.029](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2017.01.029).
- Orisakwe, O.E., Dagur, E.A., Mbagwu, H.O., Udowelle, N.A., 2017. Lead levels in vegetables from artisanal mining sites of Dilimi River, Bukuru and Barkin Ladi north Central Nigeria: cancer and non-cancer risk assessment. Asian Pac. J. Cancer Prev. 18, 621–627. [https://doi.org/10.22034/apjcp.2017.18.3.621.](https://doi.org/10.22034/apjcp.2017.18.3.621)
- Rahman, M.A., Hasegawa, H., Lim, R.P., 2012. Bioaccumulation, biotransformation and trophic transfer of arsenic in the aquatic food chain. Environ. Res. 116, 118–135.  $\frac{h}{\text{doi.org}}$ /10.1016/j.envres.2012.03.014
- Reátegui-Quispe, A., Pariona-Velarde, y D., 2019. Determination of lead, cadmium, mercury and Total Volatile Base Nitrogen (TVBN) in muscle of blue shark Prionace glauca from the southern zone of Peru, 54, 336–342. [https://doi.org/10.22370/](https://doi.org/10.22370/rbmo.2019.54.3.2029) [rbmo.2019.54.3.2029](https://doi.org/10.22370/rbmo.2019.54.3.2029).
- Rodríguez-Gutiérrez, J., Galván-Magaña, F., Jacobo-Estrada, T., Rreola-Mendoza, L., Sujitha, S.B., Jonathan, M.P., 2020. Mercury-selenium concentrations in silky sharks (Carcharhinus falciformis) and their toxicological concerns in the southern Mexican Pacific. Mar. Pollut. Bull. 153, 111011 [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2020.111011) [marpolbul.2020.111011](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2020.111011).
- [Sanjaigandhi, K., Pradhap, D., Nanthakumar, G., 2020. Heavy metal characterisation in](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162258203193)  surface sediments off southeast coast of India: implication on marine pollution. [Indian J. Geo-Mar. Sci. 49, 1810](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162258203193)–1818.
- [SCF, 2006. Scientific panel on dietetic products, nutrition and allergies. In: Tolerable](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162258567895) [Upper Intake Levels for Vitamins and Minerals. European Food Safety Authority](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162258567895).
- Sepe, A., Ciaralli, L., Ciprotti, M., Giordano, R., Funari, E., Costantini, S., 2003. Determination of cadmium, chromium, lead and vanadium in six fish species from the Adriatic Sea. Food Addit. Contam. A 20, 543–552. [https://doi.org/10.1080/](https://doi.org/10.1080/0265203031000069797) [0265203031000069797.](https://doi.org/10.1080/0265203031000069797)
- [Sharma, R., Purushothaman, C.S., Venkateshvaran, K., 2005. Length-weight relationship](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162251048707)  [and condition factor of Perna viridis \(Linnaeus, 1758\) and Meretrix meretrix](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162251048707)  [\(Linnaeus, 1758\) from Mumbai waters. J. Indian Fish. Ass. 32, 157](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162251048707)–163.
- Storelli, M.M., 2008. Potential human health risks from metals (Hg, Cd, and Pb) and polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs) via seafood consumption: estimation of target hazard quotients (THOs) and toxic equivalents (TEOs). Food Chem. Toxicol. 46, 2782–2788. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fct.2008.05.011.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fct.2008.05.011)
- Tamele, I.J., Loureiro, P.V., 2020. Lead, mercury and cadmium in fish and shellfish from the Indian Ocean and Red Sea (African countries): Public health challenges. J. Mar. Sci. Eng. 8, 344 [https://doi.org/10.3390/jmse8050344.](https://doi.org/10.3390/jmse8050344)
- Terrazas-López, R., Arreola-Mendoza, L., Galván-Magaña, F., Anguiano-Zamora, M., Sujitha, S.B., Jonathan, M.P., 2016. Cadmium concentration in liver and muscle of silky shark (Carcharhinus falciformis) in the tip of Baja California south, Mexico. Mar. Pollut. Bull. 107, 389–392. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2016.03.035.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2016.03.035)
- Torres, P., da Cunha, R.T., Rodrigues, A.D., 2016. The elasmobranch fisheries of the Azores. Mar. Pol. 73, 108–118.<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpol.2016.07.027>.
- Turoczy, N.J., Laurenson, L.J.B., Allinson, G., Nishikawa, M., Lambert, D.F., Smith, C., Cottier, J.P.E., Irvine, S.B., Stagnitti, F., 2000. Observations on metal concentrations in three species of shark (*Deania calcea*, *Centroscymnus crepidater*, and *Centroscymnus owstoni*) from southeastern Australian waters. J. Agric. Food Chem. 48, 4357–4364. [https://doi.org/10.1021/jf000285z.](https://doi.org/10.1021/jf000285z)
- [USEPA, 1991. Technical Support Document for Water Quality-based Toxics Control](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162300067219)  [\(EPA/505/2-90-001\). Washington, DC](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0025-326X(22)00253-3/rf202203162300067219).
- USEPA, 2020. United States Environmental Protection Agency, Integrated Risk Information System. [https://www.epa.gov/iris.](https://www.epa.gov/iris)
- Usero, J., González-Regalado, E., Gracia, I., 1997. Trace metals in the bivalve molluscs Ruditapes decussatus and Ruditapes philippinarum from the Atlantic Coast of Southern Spain. Environ. Int. 23, 291–298. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2018.07.098)  [envpol.2018.07.098](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2018.07.098).
- van der Schyff, V., Yive, N.S.C.K., Bouwman, H., 2020. Metal concentrations in corals from South Africa and the Mascarene Basin: a first assessment for the Western Indian Ocean. Chemosphere 239, 124784. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2019.124784)  [chemosphere.2019.124784](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2019.124784).